



European Union



Azerbaijan

FINAL NARRATIVE REPORT

“Support to the civil service training in the Republic of Azerbaijan”

Table of contents

1. List acronyms	3
2. Description	4
3. Assessment of implementation of Action activities.....	5
4. Beneficiaries/affiliated entities and other Cooperation	31
5. Visibility	32

List of acronyms used in the report

EU	European Union
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
CSC	Civil Service Commission under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan
APA	Academy of Public Administration under the Republic of Azerbaijan
TIMS	Training Information Management System
HRM	Human Resources Management
CSR	Civil Service Recruitment
HRCSD	Human Resources Management and Civil Service Recruitment Department
IRD	International Relations Department
LD	Legal Department
TC	Training Centre
TSU	Training and Strategy Unit
CSRIS	Civil Service Register Information System
SO	Specific Objective
JWG	Joint Working Group
ICT	Information Communication Technologies
QMS	Quality Management System

List of annexes

Annex 1_Project documents

Annex 2_Project reports

Annex 3_No-cost extension

Annex 4_Kick-off meeting

Annex 5_Training and Strategy Unit

Annex 6_ Identification of staff capacity building programs

Annex 7_ Organization of seminars & trainings

Annex 8_Analyses of legislation & recommendations

Annex 9_Public hearing on Civil Service Code

Annex 10_Training strategy

Annex 11_Training management system

Annex 12_ToRs for trainers

Annex 13_Training of trainers modules

Annex 14_Strategic leadership programme

Annex 15_Talent management programme

Annex 16_Work plans and training plans

Annex 17_Internal procedures of TC

Annex 18_Publications and visibility products

Annex 19_Launch of training center

Annex 20_Study tours

Annex 21_Resource centre

Annex 22_International conference

Annex 23_Guideline for the keynote speakers and presenters

Annex 24_Concept note and agenda of the international conference

Annex 25_Closing conference

Annex 26_Pilot trainings

Annex 27_Minutes of joint working groups

1. Description

- 1.1. **Name of Coordinator of the grant contract:** United Nations Development Programme (UNDP)
- 1.2. **Name and title of the contact Person:** Mr.Ghulam M.Isaczai, UNDP Resident Representative
- 1.3. **Name of beneficiary(ies) and affiliated entity(ies) in the Action:** N/A
- 1.4. **Title of the Action:** Support to the civil service training in the Republic of Azerbaijan
- 1.5. **Contract number:** ENPI/2013/335-132
- 1.6. **Start date and end date of the Action:** 12 December, 2013 – 12 June, 2017
- 1.7. **Target country(ies) or region(s):** Baku, Azerbaijan
- 1.8. **Final beneficiaries &/or target groups**¹ (if different) (including numbers of women and men): Academy of Public Administration under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, civil servants (approximately out 30,108 civil servants, 21,528 are men 8580 are women) and general population of Azerbaijan
- 1.9. **Country(ies) in which the activities take place** (if different from 1.7): N/A

¹ “Target groups” are the groups/entities who will be directly positively affected by the project at the Project Purpose level, and “final beneficiaries” are those who will benefit from the project in the long term at the level of the society or sector at large.

2. Assessment of implementation of Action activities

2.1. Executive summary of the Action

The project implemented in two stages with different beneficiaries. At the first stage, it was entitled as “Support to the Civil Service Commission under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan in implementation of the Institutional Reform Plan within the Comprehensive Institutional Building Programme”. Being a part of Institutional Reform Plan 3 (IRP3) “Strengthening civil service training in Azerbaijan with a focus on EU affairs”, it aimed at strengthening the core institutions involved into the negotiations and implementations of the EU-Azerbaijan Association Agreement.

The overall objective of the project was to strengthen the capacities of the CSC with regard to management and coordination of civil servants training and professional development function across state bodies and leading to the development and implementation of training strategy and training policies. The project focused on two specific objectives: (a) To support CSC in establishment and capacity building of its Strategy & Training Unit and Training Centre through assessment of available staff resources of the CSC, improvement of legislation, creation of facilities and resources required for full operation of the Training Centre, as well as support in staffing process, development of internal procedures for the Centre and developing of training programs. (b) To strengthen the institutional capacities of CSC to lead and coordinate the civil servants training and to provide the methodological assistance to state bodies and other training centres.

The Grant Agreement ENPI/2013/335-132 between European Union (EU) and United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) was signed in December 2013. However, due to some administrative issues the Project Document between UNDP and CSC was signed in July 2014, and therefore, the actual implementation of the project started on September 1, 2014.

See Annex 1_Project documents

During the project life, one interim report was submitted on 11 November 2015. During the reported period, the project successfully implemented many of its activities in line with the project action plan, except those that were directly related to the availability of the Training Centre. Therefore, implementation of some project activities was postponed for later period and/or shifted ahead because Training Centre of CSC was not established by that time. With authorization of EU project manager, the project revised action plan and made budget reallocation within 23% according to the General Conditions of the Contract (Article 9.4.) in May, 2015. Afterwards, the project implemented the activities in line with the approved reallocated budget. *See Annex 2_Project reports*

On 11 April, 2016, the final beneficiary of the project, Civil Service Commission under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan was unexpectedly abolished by decree of the President. Therefore, the project had to freeze all activities and terminate on-going contracts.

According to the decision of the Administration of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan, the Academy of Public Administration under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan was appointed as a new beneficiary of the Project and was entrusted to take over the project activities. The Academy of Public Administration expressed full readiness and availability to establish Training Centre for civil servants and complete the activities planned within the framework of the project. In this regard, the project requested for no-cost

extension till June 2017 to finalize all remaining activities and implement new activities in line with the project objectives. Taking into account necessity of adaptation of already developed products by both UNDP and GIZ, the projects also requested for budget revision to adjust original budget to the needs of new beneficiary. *See Annex 3_No-cost extension*

Despite delays and obstacles that the project encountered during the implementation, due to abolishment of project beneficiary, the project attained number of key results that are summarised below:

For Civil Service Commission:

- Training and Strategy Unit was established within CSC;
- Civil Service Code was analysed and recommendations to address the gaps related to professional development of civil servants are developed;
- International conference is conducted;
- EU best practise on civil service training management is learned.

For Academy of Public Administration:

- Training Centre is established and operational;
- Civil Service Training Strategy is developed and is in the process of implementation;
- Resource Centre and Library is set up at the Training Centre;
- Training Management Software is operational;
- EU best practise on civil service training management is learned;

2.2. Results and Activities

SO1. To support CSC in establishment and capacity building of its Strategy and Training Unit and Training Centre

Expected result 1.1: Training and Strategy Unit is created, staff of the Unit is trained

Indicator 1.1: TSU is developed and operationalized; staff training needs assessment is conducted

Level of achievement: Fully achieved

This activity was implemented for the first project beneficiary, CSC. Before it was abolished, TSU was set up, training needs assessment was conducted, capacity development programme was prepared and staff trained in line with the recommended programme. In line with the recommendations, project delivered two-day trainings on eight topics to 70 participants.

Expected result 1.2: Legislation on training of civil servants is reviewed and modified

Indicator 1.2: Existing legislation analysed and legislative proposals developed by the project to reflect training aspects of civil servants

Level of achievement: Fully achieved

The Civil Service Code and legal acts were analysed and gaps in legislation impeding the professional development of civil servants were identified. The recommendations to address

the gaps have been developed. However, due to abolishment of CSC, it was impossible to further proceed with implementation of the recommendations.

Expected Result 1.3: Infrastructure of Training Centre is established

Indicator 1.3: Computer equipment and software is procured and installed; Information Management System developed and operational

Level of achievement: Fully achieved

The procurement of computer equipment and training information management software was done based on consultation with the first project beneficiary, Civil Service Commission. Later, after abolishment of CSC, the purchase of equipment and software was adjusted to the needs of the Academy of Public Administration and handed over to the later.

Expected Result 1.4: Capacity gaps of TC are addressed, and TC is launched

Indicator 1.4: At least 20 trainings conducted for the staff of the Training Centre

Level of achievement: Fully achieved

The activity was initiated for the staff of Training and Strategy Unit of the CSC which was planned to be further engaged in the activity of Training Centre, and then proceeded with the staff of Training Centre of APA. Totally 21 trainings were organised to increase the capacity of TC staff, among them is training on ICT which covered 9 trainings on IT-related topics.

Expected Result 1.5: Awareness of best practises in civil service training is increased

Indicator 1.5: At least 10 staff of APA attended at least 3 study tours to study best practise in civil service training

Level of achievement: Fully achieved

Totally five study tours were organized within the project, three (Hungary, Latvia/Lithuania, Ireland) for the CSC staff and two (Spain, France) for APA staff. Totally 30 participants took part in study tours, studied best practises and developed reports including the lessons learned and recommendations for further actions.

SO2. To strengthen institutional capacities of APA to lead and coordinate the civil servants training and to provide the methodological assistance to state bodies and other training centres

Expected result 2.1: Library and Resource Centre in Training Centre is established

Indicator 2.1: Concept of the Resource Centre for training and professional development of civil servants endorsed by the APA; Learning materials are available at Library and Resource Centre; Library is fully operational

Level of achievement: Fully achieved

Concept for the Resource Centre for training and professional development of civil servants was updated, and endorsed by APA. Library and Resource Centre is operationalised with availability of more than 400 local and international publications.

Expected Results 2.2: Awareness on the best practices in selected training fields is raised

2.2 Indicator: Selected training fields and best practices in these fields identified; International conference conducted

Level of achievement: Fully achieved

Two international events have been conducted within the project with both beneficiaries. International conference on “Capacity Development during Public Administration Reform” held on 09-10 July 2015, covered the topics on Return on investment of capacity development of civil servants, Cultural change in civil service as a result of public administration reforms, Regional platforms as a tool of the capacity development of civil servants and Establishment of the civil service training centres in the framework of PAR. The second event on “Modern Civil Service: new paradigms, innovations and practices” was organized as a closing conference where the best practises on civil service training institutions operating in different countries, along with their strategies and practices; improving the quality of public service and civil service in the context of SDGs have been discussed.

B. ACTIVITIES

Activity 0. Establishment of Project Implementation Unit

Once the project activities were initiated, the project team responsible for the project implementation, was selected and recruited. The project team initially comprised of Project Manager and Project Officer who were responsible for day-to-day management of project activities as well as for financial and administrative reporting. The project rented the premises used as temporarily Training Centre (due to unavailability of TC) and aimed at enhancing the performance and efficiency of the projects by bringing the CSC, GIZ and UNDP together in one shared office. The UNDP and GIZ projects organized kick off meeting on 2 December 2014 to raise awareness of civil servants and general population on launching of both projects. The kick off meeting was attended by: Malena Mard, Ambassador EU to Azerbaijan, Antonius Broek, Resident Representative of UNDP in Azerbaijan, Wolfgang Mossinger, Deputy Head of Mission of German Embassy in Azerbaijan, and Henning Twosten, Country Director of GIZ office in Azerbaijan.

After the project beneficiary CSC was abolished on 11 April 2016, premises for project office were provided by new beneficiary, APA. The changes on the project management component were also made through active involvement of UNDP staff in day to day management of the project. UNDP Operations staff supported the project team with guidance and compliance with UNDP operational rules and procedures, UNDP Communication Specialist was also assigned to support the action’s visibility plan. *See Annex 4_Kick-off meeting*

Activity 1.1.1. Launching of the staffing process

This activity was launched with the Civil Service Commission at the first stage of the project. As per decision of CSC dated 23 September 2014 the functions of Training and Strategy Unit (TSU) have been delegated to the Human Resource Management (HRM) Sector in the Department on Human Resource Management and Civil Service Recruitment (HRMCSR). TSU consisted of 10 civil servants out of which 3 permanent servants and 7 contracted employees.

Since HRM sector did not have its own Charter, its activities were regulated by the Charter of the HRCRSR Department. In line with the item 13 of the Charter of the HRCRSR Department, HRM sector fulfilled the following functions:

- prepared proposals on development and implementation of single state HRM policies, gave proposals for improving methodologies and normative legal quarantines in HRM area, rendered methodological assistance and guidance to the government institutions in the HRM area;
- organized the implementation of all events planned for strengthening human capital and capacity building in civil service, established and developed relations and network with the organizations engaged in this area;
- participated in researches related to HRM challenges in civil service, conducted analysis and surveys;
- participated in preparing proposals on human resources management and development in civil service, as well as optimization of staff capacity in government institutions;
- participated in improving civil service as well as in development and implementation of HRM strategy, programs and other documents;
- made acquaintance and learned national legislation on human resources management and its implementation procedures as well as international best practices in this area and prepared proposals for the Chairman of CSC on application of the best international practices to the existing national legislation;
- assessed training needs in civil service and hold trainings for civil service, and considered and coordinated the activities of the government institutions to improve professional development of civil servants;
- participated in local and international seminars, trainings, courses and other events related to the development of human resources;
- ensured creation, maintenance and improvement of State Civil Service Register;
- ensured security of the State Civil Service Register's data;
- gave proposals to the Director of Department regarding working plans, drafted of periodic reports and other issues under discussion;
- went through and prepared reply to the applications received from physical persons and legal entities;
- implemented other functions envisioned in the Charter.

See Annex 5_Training and Strategy Unit

The staffing process was not continued by the project at the second stage of the project, since some of listed functions are being implemented by the Institute for Professional Development of Senior Public Administration Cadres of the Academy of Public Administration.

Activity 1.1.2. Identification of staff capacity building programme

In December 2014 – January 2015 the project contracted an expert who developed “Assessment of Capacity Development Needs of Training and Strategy Structural Unit in the State Civil Commission under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan”. The aim of the report was to assess the training needs of the Training and Strategy Unit, identify gaps in staff capacity and develop capacity building programmes for the staff of TSU of CSC. The report included the following chapters:

- Analysis of duties and responsibilities and job descriptions of the employees of Training and Strategy Structural Unit in CSC;
- Common Assessment Framework analysis;
- Interviews with the senior officials;
- Survey among TSU’s employees;
- Test of the TSU’s staff.

In order to ensure efficient and effective implementation of the activities of the HRM sector and CSC, the trainings below were recommended:

- Time management and efficient work load distribution;
- Training needs assessment methodologies;
- Dispute resolution and negotiations;
- Motivation and team building;
- Clerical works and business correspondence;
- Business communication and ethics, diplomatic and business protocol;
- HRM principles;
- Meeting organization and conduct;
- Presentations, Public speeches and event moderation skills.

See Annex 6_ Identification of staff capacity building programs

Activity 1.1.3. Organization of seminars, trainings and study visits

During the project implementation period, 21 trainings for capacity building were delivered to the staff of TSU of CSC and APA in line with the programme. In general, the project recruited five local and three international experts who delivered trainings on below indicated topics:

- Time management and efficient work load distribution;
- Training needs assessment methodologies;
- Dispute resolution and negotiations;
- Motivation and team building;
- Clerical works and business correspondence;
- Business communication and ethics, diplomatic and business protocol;
- HRM principles;
- Meeting organization and conduct;
- Presentations, Public speeches and event moderation skills;
- E-governance implementation models;
- Elimination of digital divide;
- Knowledge management system;

- ICT and MDGs;
- Data security measures;
- E-government strategic planning;
- Government-to-Business and Government-to-Citizen;
- Adoption of ICT in development and review of ICT policy;
- ICT project management;
- Result-based management;
- Ideological issues in PA;
- Quality Management Systems.

Each trainer delivered 2-3-day trainings on each topic. Totally, 90 participants from CSC and 45 participants from APA attended the trainings. *See Annex 7_ Organisation of seminars & trainings*

Activity 1.2.1. Analyses of existing legislation and legal acts

Under this activity, some actions which are of particular significance for the entire success and sustainability of the project, were taken. Effective and successful functioning of the training center can be achieved through carrying out several well-planned and interrelated tasks including analysis of existing legislation and legal acts, identifying gaps in legislation and development of recommendations to address the gaps.

To enable proper functioning of public administration in Republic of Azerbaijan and efficient development and improvement of civil servants' skills and knowledge, there was a need to have Civil Service Code ensuring public administration regulatory framework and meeting international standards. The draft Civil Service Code was developed and submitted to all concerned government agencies. The comments of the concerned government agencies as well as the report on Review of Civil Service legislation with a focus on civil servants training capacity developed by GIZ and CSC revealed the need for development of the missing chapters and articles. Therefore, the project contracted local expert who reviewed all legal acts and laws, including draft Civil Service Code, with issues related to management and delivery of trainings, retraining and professional development of civil servants. *See Annex 8_Analyses of legislation & recommendations*

Activity 1.2.2. Identification of gaps in legislation

Once the legal acts and laws were reviewed, the local expert provided the recommendations on improvement of Article 13 of the draft Civil Service Code through amendments of 12 points to this Article, as well as new edition of Chapter 20, which regulates issues related to civil servants' development and further education. The final report includes Draft of chapters and articles, justification documents supporting the developed articles in accordance with the Constitution Law on legal Acts and Summary of the expertise done on the chapter and articles related to the capacity development in civil service, education and additional education. During the process of identification of gaps in legislation, the expert hold meetings and discussions with the related representatives of the Civil Service Commission and with the experts who were engaged in researches in this field.

See Annex 8_Analyses of legislation & recommendations

Activity 1.2.3. Development of the set of recommendations to address the gaps

It was decided that the amendments and changes to the draft Civil Service Code by the local expert should be further reviewed by the international expert. The international expert reviewed how the recommended changes and amendments interact with the related laws and legislation along with international best practices and lessons learned.

The international expert had meetings with local expert who drafted amendments to chapters and articles, with representative of CSC and project manager. As a result, the expert highlighted the areas of legal regulation that ensure the development of civil service:

1. *Clear definition of the principles and values of civil service:*

Civil Service Code that is created by codification of all civil service regulation has to clearly mark and emphasize the principles and values that ensure the development of civil service. Pointing to value based regulation versus normative regulation is a growing trend in the organization of civil service.

2. *Assigning the responsibility of management and development of civil service:*

Legal organization of civil service assumes very clear assignation of areas of responsibility. In the dominating model of decentralized public administration, the responsibility of organizing civil service according to law lies on the manager of the institution/organization. He/she in turn is supervised by the authority above him.

3. *Organization and coordination of the development activities and analysis of practice of civil service, preparation, acceptance and supervision of the implementation acts in the system and volume set by the law:*

In the context of developing civil service it is important to assign an authoritative body that coordinates all civil service, and thereafter furnish the legal standing of that body. Creation of an authoritative body that coordinates all the activities related to civil service and that has clear power of decision-making is characteristic to all the states that purposefully organize their civil service. Draft of the Civil Service Code establishes a two-level system (Board and Commission) that is not sufficiently reasoned.

The function of coordination also requires a clearer emphasis in the object of the regulation of the code, and those functions should be defined in the body text of the code.

Besides, the below areas of regulation that ensure the professional development of civil service was noted by the international expert:

1. *Designation of the legal standing of the civil servant:*

Designation of the legal standing of civil service presumes that it entails a reference to the professional requirements of a person who holds a position in civil service. These requirements are set to a certain position in civil service and their existence will be checked in following ways:

1. During the competition to fulfil a certain position;
2. During the attestation and performance evaluation of the civil servant;
3. During conducting and execution of disciplinary proceedings.

2. *Designation of the rights and obligations of civil servants:*

Whilst designating the rights and obligations of civil servants it is necessary to secure a balance between obligations of the civil servants, which are the possession of special and professional skills and their development, and of those of the organization, which are the securing and enabling of professional training to the civil servant.

3. *Designation of general and organizational topics that ensure the professional development of civil servants.*

Development of civil service should be clearly regulated, and development function should be given to the authoritative body as it requires centralized management (either Commission or Board). This authoritative body shall analyse the practical implementation of the legislation regarding the governing of civil services, advise authorities on these issues and answer memorandums and requests for explanation, assemble, intermediate and analyse information about the development and management of civil service, provide explanations of this type, form opinions thereon and draft advisory guidelines. Additionally, this body should organize the administration of state personnel and payroll database.

Moreover, the code should regulate the creation and maintenance of the registry of civil servants. *See Annex 8_Analyses of legislation & recommendations*

Activity 1.2.4. Implementation of proposed recommendation

The comments and amendments made by the project experts were incorporated into the final draft Code by the legal department of CSC.

The project together with CSC conducted public hearings on final draft Civil Service Code on 12 April, 2016. The objective of public hearings was to increase public awareness about the Code, to ensure its transparency, to generate dialogues with involvement of NGOs and civil societies, to get both general and specific feedback from a broad group of participants and to promote and facilitate the approval of the Code. 51 participants representing government, CSC, NGOs, civil societies participated in the event. All the comments made at public hearings were documented.

See Annex 9_Public hearing on Civil Service Code

At the second phase of the project, it was decided to finalize civil service training strategy. Draft strategy was developed and reviewed within GIZ project, however, the adjustments were in progress at the moment when the CSC was closed. The development of Training Strategy met the overall objective of project, i.e. to strengthen the institutional capacities of APA (earlier CSC) with regard to management and coordination of civil servants training and professional development function across state bodies and leading to the development and implementation of training strategy and training policies. In this regard, the project hired local expert who finalized Civil Service Training Strategy. After series of consultation with APA management the expert carefully examined the factors considered during identifying training priorities, which are an integral part of the development of civil service activities and training programs. The existing training programs have been revised to address government priorities, current and potential needs of civil servants, and to ensure that content and delivery methods meet these needs. The finalized Training Strategy and action plan was endorsed by APA and submitted to the Administration for further actions.

See Annex 10_Training strategy

Activity 1.3.1 Procurement of IT equipment

Initially, the project partially procured IT equipment necessary for operationalisation of joint project office which was used as temporarily training centre. Once the Training Centre was set up, equipment initially procured for CSC was transferred to the Academy, and additional equipment to make the Center under APA fully operational has been procured. At the end of

the project all procured items (both procured for CSC and APA) have been handed over to the Training Centre of the Academy of Public Administration.

The procured equipment is listed below:

Description	Quantity	Year of purchase
Notebook HP Pavillion 15-n269sr, G6Q66EA	3	2014
Interwrite Touch Board 2078	1	2014
Digital Multimedia Projector Epson EB-570	1	2014
Data Sheet Fujitsu Presenter IV Air	2	2014
Interactive Visualizer AVerVision M70	1	2014
LG TV 47	1	2014
LG Smart TV 42	1	2014
Projector Epson EB-S18	1	2016
Interactive board SBM685V SMART Board M685V	1	2016
TrueConf Online Server	1	2016
Desktop PC DELL Vostro 3650 MT Intel® Core® i5-6400	31	2016
UPS 650 VA	31	2016
Laptop 2016 Newest HP Spectre 13-v021nr	1	2016
Laptop DELL Vostro 3559 Intel Core i5-6200U	1	2016
6 Extension cord	20	2016
HP Color LaserJet PRO MFP M176n Printer	2	2016
Wi-Fi USB Adapter TP-Link	31	2016
Wi-Fi Router with wan port	1	2016
HP Proliant Tower Server	1	2016
Interwrite touch board 2078	1	2017
Projector Hitachi SP-AX 3005	1	2017
Printer HP LaserJet Pro M227dw	1	2017

Pinter HP Pro M201dw	1	2017
----------------------	---	------

Activity 1.3.2 Procurement of furniture

The furniture procured at the beginning of the project, was transferred and handed over to Training Centre launched at the Academy of Public Administration. Below is given the list of furniture installed at the centre:

Description	Quantity	Year of purchase
Table	8	2014
Table	1	2014
Bookcase (with 2 doors)	2	2014
Bookcase (with glass doors)	2	2014
Case	2	2014
Working table	12	2014
Side table	10	2014
Front desk	3	2014
Bookcase with boxes	10	2014
Wardrobe	3	2014
Conference table	1	2014
Storage cabinet	2	2014
Sofa for office	2	2014
Magazine table	1	2014
Combined bookcase with wardrobe	4	2014
Fixed chair	55	2014
Round table	3	2014
Wall-in-closet	2	2014
Kitchen table	1	2014
Kitchen furniture	1	2014

Activity 1.3.3 Procurement of training software

Considering that CSC Training Centre was expected to develop different training programs, there was a need for Training Management System (TMS) to address requirements of effective and efficient information management. TMS was expected to offer online training

opportunities for the Centre, and serve as an interactive and user-friendly tool to guide all training related information, activities and resources, as well as implement all institutional activities and follow all aspects of institutional development in given time. Establishment or purchase of an appropriate TMS generated the need for the preparation of clear technical requirements. Therefore, the local expert was hired to develop the technical specifications for the Training Management System (TMS) in line with the requirements of ISO299990:2010 Learning Services for non-formal education.

See Annex 11_Training Management System

Activity 1.3.4 Development and operationalisation of Information Management System

Later, local company was contracted by the project to develop the training software based on the developed specifications.

TMS was designed to ensure complex information and analytical support to the followings processes in the Training Centre:

- Training needs assessment
- Collection and analysis of data on learners (listeners)
- Pre- and post-training analysis and research
- Training planning and schedule
- Training, including distant training offerings
- Evaluation of trainers
- Evaluation of the trainings impact on performance of trainees
- Support of daily operation of the training centre
- Solution of other problems associated with the operation of the training centre

At the second phase of the project, the software was handed over to the Training Centre of Academy of Public Administration. The IT department of APA, which is responsible for running of data centre of the Training Centre, met with the representative of the company and adjusted it to the APA's requirements. Now, the software is installed and operationalised at the Academy.

See Annex 11_Training Management System

Activity 1.4.1 Development of ToRs for trainers

Since well qualified training services may be provided only by highly professional trainers, the Training Center is expected to have trainers both in-house and outsourced. There was a need for standard forms of Terms of References and labor agreements for both in-house and outsourced trainers. For this purpose, the project recruited local expert. The local expert developed the standard form for identifying and regulating activities of trainers, information list of a trainer, Labor Agreement for in-house staff and Service Agreement for outsourced ones, Training Evaluation Form, and Act for the work done for outsourced trainers.

At the second phase of the project, the documents have been adjusted to the norms and regulations of the APA by the local expert.

See Annex 12_ToRs for trainers

Activity 1.4.2 Identification of staff capacity needs

Under this activity, the Academy of Public Administration hold consultations with employees engaged in the activity of Training Center. Based on these consultations, it was identified that staff of Training Center is required to be trained on such topics as result-based management

and evaluation, presentations and moderations skills, ideological issues in public administration, motivation and etc.

Totally, 30 participants from APA attended the two-three day trainings on above-mentioned topics.

See Annex 6_Identification of staff capacity building programs

Activity 1.4.3 Organization of seminars to introduce models and training information systems used in EU countries

Under this activity, the seminar with participation of APA representatives involved in activity of Training Centre and IT team responsible for development and operationalization of training information system, took place at the Academy of Public Academy. The expert of Centre has made research and presented the models of training management systems used in EU countries, IT team presented training management system to be used in Training Centre. Totally 15 persons participated at the seminar.

See Annex 11_Training Management System

Activity 1.4.4 Delivery of Training of Trainers on training cycle management and strategic training management

The process of development of ToTs for the Training Centre was delayed due to the abolishment of Civil Service Commission. Later the process was initiated at the second stage of the project, after the Academy of Public Administration was appointed as a new beneficiary. Based on consultations with the Academy different topics for the ToTs were determined. The development of standard training curricula in selected priority areas will facilitate introduction of unified/single standards in all training materials and training delivery in the Training Center.

The local and international experts were recruited for designing and developing training curricula and all supporting materials on defined topics and preparing for and delivering pilot training on each of training topics. *See Annex 13_ Training of Trainers modules*

All developed training curricula;

- reflected the main principles of learning including active involvement, motivation and feedback mechanism, individual approach, sequencing and structuring, effective transfer of knowledge/skills;
- met the needs of participants;
- applied multi-media tools including slide-shows, pictures, videos, etc.;
- were comprised of well-ordered, simple and involving content which is easy to understand and follow;
- ensured interactive communication with the trainees through debates, Q&A and brainstorming sessions, case studies, quizzes, role-plays, as well as competitive, individual and group activities;
- balanced interactive-independent-instructor led training experiences.

Besides, the training curricula developed within GIZ project were taken onboard by the Academy and adjusted by the local experts.

Below is given list of training modules developed within the project:

1. Sustainable development goals: planning and management

2. Human resources formation for sustainable development
3. Public relations in public administration
4. Change management
5. Stress management
6. Azerbaijan national security priorities
7. Effective business management
8. Legal provisions for amendments to constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan
9. Sustainability of natural resources management
10. Azerbaijan model of multiculturalism
11. Strategic management
12. E-governance in public sector
13. Reforms in public administration and key directions in personnel policy
14. Strategic objectives and priorities of agricultural sector in Azerbaijan
15. Human resource management
16. Teambuilding and motivation
17. Project management
18. Leadership skills
19. Conflict management, negotiation and mediation
20. Interviewing skills
21. Training for trainers
22. Presentation skills
23. Time and workload management
24. E-module – Ethics and elimination of corruption in public administration
25. E-module – Performance appraisal
26. Organization and management of civil service training
27. Road map: design and implementation
28. Guide to building professional competencies
29. Career planning in staff capacity building
30. Control system in public administration
31. Decision making mechanism in civil service
32. Evaluation and monitoring of state programme implementation
33. Result based management

Once the trainings on developed modules were delivered to the trainers of APA, the training modules were handed over to the Academy. Thereafter, APA organized 31 pilot trainings on the mentioned modules to the more than 500 civil servants. The trainings were delivered by the staff of Training Center of APA, and are planned to involve the civil servants in regions as well via distant trainings which have been piloted within the project. *See Annex 26_Pilot trainings*

As it was planned by the modified logframe, the Academy of Public Administration was expected to take onboard and localize the Strategic Leadership Programme which was developed by the GIZ project. During the process of localization, project expert reviewed the training materials developed within the previous programme, as well as feedbacks of the participants. The programme comprised of eight modules was adjusted in line with training strategy of the Academy and according to the needs of senior civil servants. The title of

modules as well as training materials were adopted to the Azerbaijani language terminology. The below indicated topics are included in the SLP:

- Leadership skills and strategic leadership
- Professional competencies
- Change management
- Team work and motivation
- Conflict management, negotiation and mediation
- Capacity building for SDGs
- E-governance
- HR in Public Administration

Once the SLP was localized and handed over to APA which organized 2-day trainings per modules for 160 civil servants from different state agencies. *See Annex 14_Strategic Leadership Programme*

One of the recommendations put forward in post study tour report to Ireland organized by the project, is to develop and deliver training programme for the newly recruited civil servants who gained the highest scores during recruitment process. Such a program in Azerbaijan is decided to be named as Talent Management Program (TMP). The investment in newly recruited most capable civil servants will result in providing incentives to the capable and knowledgeable young professionals go to the civil service that in its turn will improve and strengthen the capacity of civil service and quality of services rendered by entire civil service. In this regard, the project decided to hire local expert who made research of best practices, prepared concept of the programme and gave detailed description of actions to be done for implementation of the programme. According to the concept, TMP must cover newly recruited civil servants who gained 86 scores during test exam and 17 scores during interviews, people from reserve list who gained high scores during recruitment process and young civil servants who demonstrated excellent performance and evidence of leadership behavior on the job. The expert suggested to implement the programme through trainings, study tour/short internships in different civil service organizations and coaching.

See Annex 15_Talent Management Programme

As an initial step, The Academy of Public Administration planned to organize trainings for the young civil servants who demonstrated excellent performance and evidence of leadership behavior on the job. The inquiry was send to the state agencies to attract the talented young civil servants.

Based on recommendations of expert, below suggested trainings with indicated topics were organized for 50 civil servants.

No	Name of the Model	Topics Suggested for the Model	The aim of the training
1.	The ideological issues of public administration	a. Strategies of public administration in Azerbaijan b. Methods and tools of public administration	Is aimed at gaining knowledge about the basics and principles of the system of government, the

		c. Models and best international practices of public administration d. Strategic management	theoretical models and modern international practices of public administration, the basic mechanisms and technologies of improving the efficiency of public administration in modern conditions, as well as the priorities of the Government of the Azerbaijan Republic
2.	Manager development	a. Team management b. Motivation and team development c. Planning, organization and the achievement of results d. Decision making	Is aimed at building managerial capacity to manage team, learning techniques and tools of team building and team development, methods of planning, organizing and achieving results and etc.
3.	Communication management	a. Successful public speaking b. Communication with media c. Crisis communication d. Presentation skills	Is aimed at learning of tools and methods of presentation, writing press releases, making public speeches, ethical behavior with media and etc.
4.	Management	a. Change management b. Culture management c. Project management	Is aimed at learning of being flexible and adaptive to the new environment, methods of managing processes and projects and etc.
5.	Soft skills	a. Business Protocol and Business Etiquette b. Time management c. Conflict management d. Negotiations skills	Is aimed at getting knowledge and skills, learning tools and techniques of time management, distribution of work load, tasks prioritization, methods of and ways of conflict resolution and negotiations and etc.
6.	Coaching	Coaching	Is aimed at learning techniques and tools of coaching

Activity 1.4.5 Development of the work plans and training plans

Under this activity, the project intended to develop work plans and trainings plans for the Training Centre. Initially, the international expert was recruited to prepare the Guidelines for Work/Training Plans Development. The objective of the Guideline was to support the APA in establishment of the Training Centre and capacity building of its staff by providing a brief

background and justification for the need of developing sound work and training plans, highlighting key principles to be respected as well as giving practical advice and examples to help to convert the strategy and objectives into action – effective work and training plans. These Guidelines also help to provide common understanding of work and training plans in Training Centre.

In practice, good developed training plans can help ensure responsiveness to the needs of government organizations and individual learners and contribute to ensuring a uniform approach to civil service development. As per expert's recommendation, the training plan must include subjects of trainings, priority level, period and target group of the training. If required there also there can be training objectives, methods and source of funding mentioned.

When drawing up a training plan of the Training Centre should take into account key principles stated in Training Strategy for Civil Servants in Azerbaijan and which are relevant for effectiveness of the Training Centre:

- Commitment – compliance of training of civil servants with objectives of a public authority, service functions of a civil service position, as well as with individual development needs of a civil servant;
- Purposefulness – conducting training of civil servants for the purpose of improvement of public authorities' performance and civil servants' development;
- Efficiency – getting more quality outcomes by spending less resources on the training of civil servants;
- Systematises – conducting training of civil servants in a systematic way while coordinating it with developments in performance of public authorities and civil servants;
- Sustainability – taking into account perspective needs while planning training of civil servants that also meet current training needs;
- Equality – providing equal opportunities and conditions for all civil servants
- Co-operation – duly mutual co-operation of all stakeholders in the training of civil servants.

In addition, the international expert submitted templates for Annual Work Plan, Annual Training Plan, Quarterly Training Plan, Monthly Training Plan, Staff Development Plan and Procurement Plan of the Training Centre.

At the end of assignment, 2-day training on work plan and training plan development were delivered to the 16 trainers of the APA.

Afterwards, the project local expert consulted with the international expert and developed annual and monthly training plans of the Training Centre. The trainings will cover the training modules developed by the project expert, trainings were sorted by the priorities, months and dates. The submitted plan was endorsed and approved by the APA management. *See Annex 16_Work plans and Training Plans*

In addition, the local and international experts were recruited for development of the internal procedures of the Training Centre. At the end, the procedures have been adjusted to the need of APA. This standard operating procedure sets out the approach used in the Training Centre to ensure that services of external trainers conform to requirements. The procedure applies to the training services provided by the Centre, incorporating services of the external trainers. The internal procedures include the structure and list of the procedures, as well as procedures for selection of trainers, procedures for organization of trainings, procedures for development

of pool of trainers, procedures for training plan development, procedures for communications, procedures for ethics and security. *See Annex 17_Internal Procedures of TC*

Activity 1.4.6 Development of training and promotional materials

Under this activity, the project compiled all the training materials with assistance of local expert who edited the training modules with supporting materials as well as some promotional products. At the end of the project 20 training modules (3000 pcs) were published and handed over to the Training Centre. *See Annex 18_Publications and Visibility Products*

Activity 1.4.7 Launch of the Training Centre

The Academy of Public Administration provided premises in its building for the Training Centre. The project made some renovation works, installed necessary furniture and equipment to set up the Centre and make it fully operationalized. The Training Centre consists of 2 training rooms, Data Centre (where software is operating) and Resource Centre and Library.

The Training Centre for civil servants was officially launched on December 08, 2017. The event started with ribbon cutting ceremony and followed by speeches by the UDNP Resident Representative Mr. Ghulam M. Isaczai, the Rector of the Academy of Public Administration, academician Urkhan Alakbarov and the Head of Delegation of the European Union to Azerbaijan, Mrs. Malena Mard. Totally 60 participants attended the event, among them were APA and mass media representatives.

See Annex 19_Launch of Training Centre

Activity 1.5.1 Undertake at least three study tours to different EU countries to study the experience of centralized civil service training management system

During the reporting period three study tours were organized for the representatives of CSC, and two study tours for APA employee who will be engaged in the activity of the Training Centre. The project sent inquiries to several institutions dealing with the trainings in Public Administration. The received proposals were reviewed in terms of cost efficiency, the form of organization: centralized and decentralized, as well as interest of project beneficiary in learning the experience of certain institutions. As a result, the project selected together with CSC/APA the institutions and countries for study tours based on the above-mentioned criteria.

The first study tour was arranged to National Institute of Public Administration (NIPA) in Hungary on 15-17 December, 2014. The team consisting of the 5 persons learned the experience of Hungary in civil service training and development and feasibility of the application of the lessons learned in Azerbaijan. Following the visit, the representatives of CSC developed the report on the study tour to Hungary whereby they highlighted what they learned during the visit and made the following recommendations on what looks feasible to apply in CSC:

- Prohibit an employee who is recruited based on a temporary labor contract to work in the civil service in case he/she fails to pass civil service exam within one year from the first day of his/her recruitment. Such an employee should be recruited to the civil service again only if he/she manages to pass successfully civil service exam.

- Introduce mandatory training for a civil servant recruited for the first time via civil service exam developed based on a special program irrespective of his/her probation period. The first part of the training shall be delivered by the CSC before a civil servant starts the work, and the second part of the training shall be distant or in the mixed form and delivered by the CSC and/or by a relevant government body based on the program developed together by them. The probation period ends for a civil servant who successfully passes exam.
- Organize profile of any civil servant in the portal of CSC's training center. And provide the right to a civil servant participate in the unlimited number of trainings via his/her profile. A civil servant who successfully passes special tests may be awarded by a relevant certificate. Certificates may facilitate the promotion of a civil servant.
- Restrict the number of free of charge trainings for civil servants to strengthen financial sustainability of the training center. For instance, each civil servant may undertake only four trainings free of charge. If a civil servant undertakes a training exceeding the limit, then it should be on a payable basis. The earnings from payable trainings may be used for development of additional training modules and renewing training materials.
- Introduce a small fee for final exam following free of charge trainings (that will cover the cost of the exam's organization). To issue certificates only to those civil servants who successfully pass exam. This will increase demands to the exams and give weight and importance to certification
- Introduce proficiency exams for certain positions. It will lead to restriction of the number of applicants for these positions and will motivate applicants to be more well prepared and feel more responsible
- Introduce in future the practice of wage increase based on the results of the proficiency exams when and as wage system is improved.
- Introduce an amendment to the Azerbaijan legislation regulating exemption of the employer from the payment of 22% state social contributions within 1-3 years for hiring civil servants who lost their jobs due to liquidation of a government body and/or the job cuts, irrespective if an employer is a government body, legal entity or physical persons. In case, an employer is a government institution, then the exemption period may be even longer. Thus government investments made to the civil servant can be saved.
- To encourage ministries to recruit civil servants from the reserve list. It will also save government investments.
- To introduce exams similar to the CSC's recruitment exams for the applicants for non-administrative positions. The interview stage shall not be obligatory and is up to decision of the employer. Passing scores may be 50-70% depending on the classification of the position and may differ from position to position. The introduction of such an experience for the non-administrative positions in civil service will improve and strengthen quality and transparency of the recruitment system.

The second study tour was organized to two countries in one go, Latvia and Lithuania. It was decided to take advantage of these countries being located very close by. The team consisting of 10 persons visited Latvian School of Public Administration during July 27-28, 2015 and then Lithuanian Institute of Public Administration during July 30-31, 2015. The study tour was very interesting and out of two organizations the tour participants feel more benefited from the experience of Latvian School of Public Administration. Following the visit, the tour participants developed the report on the study tour to Latvian School of Public Administration and Lithuanian Institute of Public Administration whereby they highlighted

what most of all they liked during the visit and made recommendations on what they would like to be implemented in CSC. Some of them are given below:

- Differentiate the test questions and their number for recruitment test exams at CSC in line with administrative grade classification positions (in Latvia 125 for managers and 100 for others). It will improve and make more fair recruitment process ;
- Add Article to Civil Service Code that will regulate its activities (define the status of the Training Center, its functions, material technical base and some of its expenditures). It will facilitate the work of Training Center;
- Add Article to Civil Service Code that will envision trainings at the account of the employer and authorizing a civil servant to stay in his/her position within 5 years after trainings. It will make managers feel responsible in identifying trainees and apply skills and knowledge received at the training by the trainee during 5 years;
- Conduct trainings based on the order made and funded by government bodies. The latter have to make the order in the result of training needs assessment conducted among their employees. This will allow to reveal capacity gaps and needs of civil servants and make government bodies feel more responsible in the issue of trainings;
- Turn out Training Center on self- supporting basis like in Latvia and Lithuania a and have three types of trainings, at the account of Training Center, Government Bodies and state budget;
- Assign one person in each government body who will be in charge for all trainings issues. The person should be selected by the participation of CSC representative among candidates suggested by the government body. This will ensure more efficient training management;
- Identify trainers among successful trainees who received certificates. The training date that will be conducted by a trainer from government body should be agreed with the management of the organization one month before and the training date will be considered as a working day for a trainer;
- Introduce practice of training evaluation not only by trainees by also by another trainer(s) observing the training. This will make trainers feel more responsible;
- Introduce practice of evaluating a trainer and trainees not only immediately after training but also following six months. This practice will allow to attract to trainees really interested in trainings but not spending their time there;

The third study tour was organized to the Institute of Public Administration (IPA) in Dublin, Ireland during December 7-9, 2015. The team of 5 persons learned the Irish experience in the field of civil service training and development and feasibility of the application of the lessons learned in Azerbaijan. The study tour participants developed the post study tour report whereby they highlighted the lessons learned and made the recommendations below on what looks feasible and useful to apply in CSC:

- Develop and submit proposal to extend the authority of CSC to recruit not only civil servants for the grades 4-7 but also for upper grades (1-3) and also top management (the Mayor and Deputy Mayor) in the municipalities. This will strengthen transparent and democratic recruitment process;
- Introduce practice of post training cross check survey (questionnaire) with the managers and colleagues of the trainees to conduct post training performance appraisal and reveal to what extend the trainings had positive impact on the work of a trainee. This will result in strengthening responsibility both of trainees and their managers towards trainings;

- Introduce the Section to the Civil Service Registry Information System (CSRIS) containing information on pre and post training skills of a trainee. The newly developed TIMS should have interface with CSRIS. The availability of such information in CSRIS and TIMS will facilitate the development of reports, analysis and post training evaluation;
- Initiate trainings on coaching and mentoring for senior officials and managers in civil service with the aim to introduce new training elements like coaching and mentoring in Azerbaijan. On the job trainings like coaching and mentoring will facilitate training of civil servants on the spot without leaving working place.
- Initiate Talent Management Programme for newly recruited civil servants who gained high scores during the recruitment process (at least 87 scores for tests and 17,5 scores during interview) This program desirably should consists of different types of trainings like training itself, coaching, mentoring and study tour. Talent Management Programme will facilitate promotion of capable knowledgeable young civil servants to the management positions.
- Create centralized human resource services like in Ireland. Later, it may be in the form of LLC. It is very effective during the economic crises period.

The project twice made cost sharing with GIZ to cover the cost of study visits of the CSC employees as per the request of CSC management. The project covered Daily Subsistence Allowance whereas GIZ project covered travel cost. The first study visit was to the conference on “Insourcing and Outsourcing: How do they contribute to public administration reform” during 21-23 May, 2015 in Tbilisi, Georgia. The second study visit was to the conference on “25th anniversary of KSAP” in Warszawa, Poland on 19 June, 2015.

Both events were very relevant to the project work and Commission benefited from them. They learned new experiences and established good network with the organizations. As a result, the project and SCS benefited from the established networks during the international conference as of 9-10 July, 2015. Most key note speakers and presenters were identified and invited to the conference from these organizations. Furthermore, the employees of CSC listened to the research presentations on the issues of modernization of government management, education and training of civil servants, government funds management, reforms conducted by public organizations, etc and also participated in the discussions of these issues in the NISPAcee conference. Following the study tour the participants made the following recommendations to CSC :

- Consider membership issue to ensure more close collaboration among two organizations. It will be more appropriate if Training Center will be a member of NISPAcee as it will benefit more;
- Present researches made by CSC employees on the next NISPAcee events. The Cooperation with NISPAcee will facilitate and help CSC to initiate its research works.

If the NISPAcee conference was remarkable from research point of view, the KSAP conference provided a lot of information on how KSAP was established, what were challenges and lessons learned, on education and training programmes. Upon return the study visit participants made the following recommendations to CSC:

- To establish network of gradulators of leadership program;
- To identify trainers from leadership program;
- Introduce mentoring practice for gradulators of leadership program.

After the abolishment of the Commission, all recommendations and lessons learned by the CSC have been transferred to the newly established State Examination Centre where the staff of CSC are engaged.

At the second phase of the project, two study tours have been arranged for the staff of APA. One of visit was organized to Spanish National Institute of Public Administration (INAP) on 12-15 December 2016. Team of 5 persons visited Madrid to familiarize with the experience of INAP as well as to learn the Spanish civil service system, INAP's professional career model, training programs for civil servants, senior civil servants/managers and local administration. During the study tour the delegation visited Ministry of Finance and Civil Service. Experts from the Ministry of Civil Service explained the recruitment process is under supervision of their Ministry.

The study tour participants developed the post study tour report whereby they highlighted the lessons learned and made the recommendations below on what looks feasible and useful to apply in APA:

- There is a need for APA develop strategic plan and express its mission and vision for a certain period of time;
- Arrange trainings for newly recruited civil servants;
- Prepare a dictionary for evaluating competency and demand of civil servants;
- Provide short-term tailored trainings to the government employees by their requests based on the Agreements signed;
- Provide full-time, distant and mixed education to civil servants;
- Arrange language courses for civil servants in accordance with their specialization
- Provide trainings for disabled persons to prepare them for the civil service;
- Arrange short term trainings on modern and demanded topics for volunteer participation of civil servants;
- Provide special trainings for disabled people and help them to be prepared for civil service exam;
- To be involved in the process of preparation of civil service examination tests;

The second visit was organized for teams of 6 persons to the National School of Administration of France (ENA) on 28 February-05 March 2017. During the study tour the delegation had a series of meetings and trainings at Paris National Administration School under Prime Minister of France (ENA), Institute of Sciences (Sciences Po) and Paris VIII University. During the meetings, the delegation received information on French public administration system, civil service, recruitment to civil service, development and implementation of training strategy.

The study tour participant developed the following recommendations for implementation by APA:

- implement short-term trainings for newly recruited civil servants in APA;
- implement webinar and video trainings in APA to ensure more convenient participation in trainings of representative of executive authorities, municipalities and government bodies in the regions;
- Use the experience of France for providing trainings by the request of state agencies;
- Provide long-term education for foreign students in APA;

- Prepare and disseminate extended training catalogue among the state agencies;
- Develop training strategy and rules for increasing training efficiency;
- To be involved in civil servant's recruitment process;
- To extend and enrich the library of APA/Resource Centre.

It worth to mention that some recommendations, related training strategy, training provision and extension of the learning resources in the Library, were considered within the project activities and were in progress in that time. *See Annex 20_Study tours*

Activity 2.1.1 Development of the concept for the Resource Centre for training and professional development of civil servants

This activity was initiated at the first stage of the project. The project contracted the local expert to develop Concept of Resource Centre. The expert also developed list of learning materials related to public administration and civil service that are recommended for procurement for the Resource Centre. As a result, 100 publications available at the local book houses have been initially procured. The developed concept was adjusted to the APA policy and procedures at the second stage of the project. The concept includes introduction of objectives and operational management of the Centre, as well as classification of resources. As per the adjustments, the Resource Centre will be also used as research centre with access to scientific researches in the field of public administration. *See Annex 21_Resource Centre*

Activity 2.1.2 Identification and purchasing of information materials for the resource centre

Along with the concept of Resource Centre, the expert prepared list of local and foreign publications based on consultation with the CSC. Thereafter, the list was updated as per the requirements of new project beneficiary, Academy of Public Administration. The updated list included 192 local and foreign publications related to the public administration. The publications have been purchased and handed over the Academy. *See Annex 21_Resource Centre*

Activity 2.2.1 Selected training fields are identified

Preparation for international conference was initiated well in advance. Firstly, the project explored together with SCS training fields and best practices in these fields. Then the issue was discussed at the meeting of Joint Working Group conducted 18 November 2015. The project held final discussion with CSC on the issue at the end of January 2015 whereby all comments and suggestions of the working group were also considered. As a result of discussions, the following four topics were identified: 1. Return on Investment of Capacity Development of Civil Servants; 2. Cultural change in civil service as a result of Public Administration Reforms; 3. Regional platforms as a tool of the capacity development of civil servants and 4. Establishment of the civil service training centres in the framework of PAR. All four topics are directly linked with capacity building of civil service and regarded as very important issues during the process of Public Administration Reforms. Furthermore, all four topics directly related to the project work, as the project objectives are establishment of Training Centre, capacity building of its staff and strengthening institutional capacities of CSC for turning them into the leading force in the field of civil service training. At the meeting the title, and date of the conference were identified and the project gave start for its preparations. The project developed draft agenda and list of what to do with the view of the feedback of the

working group regarding previous international conference held by the GIZ in September 2015. *See Annex 27_Minutes of joint working groups*

Activity 2.2.2 Best practice in selected training fields are identified

The project contracted an expert who made research on selected fields, topics and best practices in civil service trainings. As a result, keynote speakers have been determined as per the session topics of the conference. The expert prepared the guideline for the keynote speakers and presenters.

See Annex 23_Guideline for the keynote speakers and presenters

Activity 2.2.3 Content of the international conference is developed

The expert developed a concept note and agenda of the international conference based on consultations with CSC. As per developed concept, the objective of the Conference was to familiarize participants with the benefits, the challenges of Capacity Development during PAR, as well as to provide a platform to international and local experts to express their opinions. The conference covered general issues and challenges, which might be encountered in the course of Capacity Development process during PAR. In addition, the second expert was contracted for facilitation at the conference. *See Annex 24_Concept note and agenda of the international conference*

Activity 2.2.4 International conference is conducted

The two-day international conference on “Capacity Development during Public Administration Reform” was conducted during 9-10 July 2015 at Fairmont Hotel Baku at Flames Towers. The conference consisted of opening session, four working sessions and working group discussions and closing ceremony. Each working session was open by keynote speaker and followed by 2/3 presentations from different countries. The conference was attended by 114 participants out of which 40 foreign participants from 25 countries, 18 participants from diplomatic corpus in Azerbaijan and the rest local participants -56. The first day started with opening session where opening remarks were made Mr. B Khalilov, Chairman of the SCS, Mr. Antonious Broek, Resident Representative of UNDP in Azerbaijan, Mr. Jeroen Willems, the Head of Cooperation Section of the EU Delegation in Azerbaijan, Mrs. Heidrun Tempel, and the Ambassador of Germany in Azerbaijan. Following the opening session, the two working sessions were held: 1. Return on Investment of Capacity Development of Civil Servants and 2. Cultural change in civil service as a result of Public Administration Reforms. Two working sessions were held in the second day: 1. Regional platforms as a tool of the capacity development of civil servants and 2. Establishment of the civil service training centres in the framework of PAR. The working sessions were followed by discussions of working groups. And the conference was closed by concluding remarks.

The local expert on workshop content management prepared minutes at the meeting and drafted post conference brochure to be endorsed by the project and CSC and later published.

The conference was well highlighted by mass media: 6 TV channels and 19 on-line and 12 print news agencies. The project also received gratitude letters from the conference participants for very interesting and useful conference and very well its organization. The conference was also video filmed and photo shot during two days. Video discs and group photo was prepared and disseminated to participants. *See Annex 22_International Conference*

At the end of the project, the closing conference, with participation of 20 representatives of international public administration institutions as well as local 50 civil servants and APA representatives, were held on 05-06 June, 2017. The topic of the two-day conference was “Modern Civil Service: new paradigms, innovation and practices” that addressed the issues of quality improvement of public services, existing know-hows, the role of training institution in developing relevant strategies and practices and the impact of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) to civil services globally. The conference covered the following topics:

- Civil Service Training Institutions: strategies and practices
- Improving the Quality of Public Service: Azerbaijan and international practice
- Civil Service in the Context of Sustainable Development Goals

Totally 150 participants attended the event which was opened by the speeches of EU, UNDP Resident Representative Mr. Ghulam M. Isaczai, Head of APA Mr. Urkhan Alakbarov, Head of operation section of EUD Mr. Jeroen Willems, Minister of Natural Resources Mr. Huseynghulu Baghirov, Head of ASAN Mr. Inam Kerimov. Then conference was followed by sessions in which the best practices on above mentioned areas have been presented. It created excellent opportunity of APA to present the Training Centre and project outputs to the conference participants. The event was highlighted by the local mass media. *See Annex 25_Closing Conference*

2.3. Describe if the Action will continue after the support from the European Union has ended. Are there any follow up activities envisaged? What will ensure the sustainability of the Action?

After consultation with APA management, project expert developed a work plan and training plan for the Training Centre. As per developed plans, the trainings for the civil servants by the training modules will be continued by the Academy. The Talent Management Programme for newly recruited civil servants and Senior Leadership Programme piloted during the project, will be proceeded. In addition, the recommendation developed as result of study tours will be further implemented by the Academy. This will ensure the sustainability of the action.

Besides, the training modules and all supporting materials will be updated by the trainers of the centre, and new modules will be developed by the request of state agencies. *See Annex 16_Work plan and training plan for the Training Centre*

- 2.4. Submit an updated Logframe matrix, highlighting the changes. When the planning has included milestones (intermediary target values), the updated logframe matrix should allow to compare the achievements at the date of the reporting with the corresponding values in earlier reports (when relevant) and with the corresponding milestones and final target.

	Intervention logic	Indicators	Baseline (incl. reference year)	Current value Reference date	Targets (incl. reference year)	Sources and means of verification	Assumptions
Overall objective: Impact	<p><u>For CSC (before abolishment):</u> "Strengthen the capacities of the Civil Service Commission in management and coordination of civil servants training and professional development function across state bodies and leading the development and implementation of training strategy and training policies"</p> <p><u>For APA:</u> "Strengthen the capacities of the Academy of Public Administration in management and coordination of civil servants training and professional development function across state bodies and leading the development and implementation of training strategy and training policies"</p>	<p><i>Training Centre for Civil Servants under the Civil Service Commission is fully operational.</i></p> <p><i>Training Centre for Civil Servants under the Academy of Public Academy is fully operational.</i></p>			2017, institutional capacity of APA increased to manage the trainings for professional development of civil servants	<i>Project evaluation</i>	<i>An enabling policy environment</i>
	Specific objective(s):	<p><u>SO1 for CSC (before abolishment):</u> To support CSC in establishment and capacity building of its Strategy & Training Unit and Training Centre</p> <p><u>SO1 for APA:</u> To support APA in establishment and capacity building of the Training Centre</p> <p><u>SO2 for CSC:</u> To strengthen the institutional capacities of CSC to lead and coordinate the civil servants training and to provide the methodological assistance to state bodies and other training centers</p> <p><u>SO2 for APA:</u> To strengthen the institutional capacities of APA to lead and coordinate the civil servants training and to provide the methodological assistance to state bodies and other training centers</p>	<p>SO1. "Indicator 1": Fully operational Strategy and Training Unit of the CSC is established; Training Centre is created; Relevant staff is recruited, trained and operational budget is allocated</p> <p>SO2. "Indicator 2" Training Centre is capable and authorized to cover trainings for whole range of civil servants; Pilot trainings are delivered</p>		2017, Training Centre is already operating and delivering the training for civil servants	By 2017 Training Centre and its Resource Centre/Library established	<p><i>Project evaluation</i></p> <p><i>Regulation of Strategy and Training Unit (CSC) and Training Centre (AP-A)</i></p> <p><i>List of Trainers trained</i></p> <p><i>Training Centre operational budget</i></p> <p><i>Work plans and training plans</i></p> <p><i>Training and promotional materials</i></p>

Outputs	<p>R1.1: Training and Strategy Unit in the CSC is created – staff of the Unit is trained</p> <p>R1.2: Legislation on training of civil servants is reviewed and modified</p> <p>R1.3 Infrastructure of the Training Centre is established</p> <p>R1.4: Capacity gaps of the Training Centre are addressed, and Training Centre is launched</p> <p>R1.5: Awareness of best practises in civil service training is increased.</p> <p>R2.1 Library and Resource Centre in the Training Centre is established</p> <p>R2.2 Awareness on the best practices in selected training fields is raised</p>	<p>1.1 "Indicator 1": target value (R1.1)</p> <p>Strategy of the Training Unit is developed and operationalized, staff training needs assessment is conducted</p> <p>1.2 "Indicator 1": target value (R1.2)</p> <p>Existing legislation analysed and legislative proposals developed by the project to reflect training aspects of civil servants.</p> <p>1.3 "Indicator 1": target value (R1.3)</p> <p>Computer equipment and software is procured and installed</p> <p>Information Management System developed and operational</p> <p>1.4 "Indicator 1": target value (R1.4)</p> <p>At least 20 trainings conducted for the staff of the Training Centre</p> <p>1.5 "Indicator 1": target value (R1.5)</p> <p>At least 10 of staff of APA attended at least 2 study tours to study best practice in Civil Service Training.</p> <p>2.1"Indicator 1": target value (R2.1)</p> <p>Concept for the Resource Centre for training and professional development of civil servants endorsed by the APA</p> <p>Learning materials are available at Library and Resource Centre</p> <p>Library is fully operational</p> <p>2.2"Indicator 1": target value (R2.2)</p> <p>Selected training fields and best practices in these field identified</p> <p>International conference conducted</p>	<p>2017, Training Strategy is developed and in the process of implementation</p> <p>2017, IMS is already operational</p> <p>2017, 31 pilot trainings for civil servants are delivered</p> <p>2016-2017, 10 staff of APA participated at study tours to Spain and France</p> <p>2017, Library and Resource Centre is already operating</p> <p>2015 International Conference was held</p>	<p>By 2017 Training Strategy developed</p> <p>2016 Existing legislation analysed and legislative proposals developed</p> <p>2016 Computer equipment and software procured and installed</p> <p>2017 Information Management System operational</p> <p>By 2017, 30 pilot trainings delivered to at least 150 civil servants</p> <p>10 of staff of APA attended 2 study tours.</p> <p>2017 Concept for the Resource Centre for training and professional development of civil servants endorsed by the APA</p> <p>2017 Library is fully operational</p> <p>2015 International Conference held</p>	<p><i>What are the sources of information for these indicators?</i></p> <p>Project reports,</p> <p>Project evaluation</p> <p>Strategy of the Training Unit</p> <p>Training needs assessment</p> <p>Seminars, trainings programme, materials and participants lists</p> <p>Review of the legislation and proposals on its amendments</p> <p>List of equipment purchased</p> <p>Outline of the Information Management System</p> <p>Transfer of ownership act</p> <p>Seminars and training courses plans and materials</p> <p>List of trainees</p> <p>Study Tour programme</p> <p>List of Study Tours participants</p> <p>Study Tours participants reports</p> <p>Concept for the resource centre</p> <p>List learning materials</p> <p>List of selected training fields and information on the best practices in these field</p> <p>International conference programme, materials, list of participants</p>	<p><i>An enabling policy environment</i></p>

Activities	<p>A1.1.1.Launching of the staffing process</p> <p>A1.1.2.Identification of staff capacity building programs</p> <p>A1.1.3.Organization of seminars, trainings and study visits</p> <p>A1.2.1.Analyses of existing legislation and legal acts</p> <p>A1.2.2.Identification of gaps in legislation</p> <p>A1.2.3.Development of the set of recommendations to address the gaps</p> <p>A1.2.4. Implementation of proposed recommendations</p> <p>A1.3.1.Procurement of IT equipment</p> <p>A1.3.2.Procurement of furniture</p> <p>A1.3.3.Procurement of training software</p> <p>A1.3.4 Development and operationalization of Information Management System</p> <p>A1.4.1. Identification of staff capacity building needs</p> <p>A1.4.2. Development of the TORs for trainers</p> <p>A1.4.3.Organization of seminar to introduce models and training information management systems used in EU countries</p> <p>A1.4.4.Delivery of Trainings for Trainers on training cycle management and strategic training management</p> <p>A1.4.5.Development of the work plans and training plans.</p> <p>A1.4.6 Development of training and promotional materials</p> <p>A1.4.7 Launch of the Training Centre</p> <p>A 1.5.1 Organization of at least three study tours to different countries to study the experience of the Civil Service training management systems.</p> <p>A 2.1.1 Development of the concept for the resource centre for training and professional development of civil servants</p> <p>2.1.2 Identification and purchasing of information materials for the resource centre and library</p> <p>2.2.1 Selected training fields are identified</p> <p>2.2.2 Best practices in selected training fields identified</p> <p>2.2.3 Content of the international conference is developed</p> <p>2.2.4 International conference is conducted.</p>	<p>Means:</p> <p>Technical Assistance: International and Local Experts</p> <p>Procurement of the equipment, software and furniture</p> <p>Technical Assistance: Development of Training modules, international and national experts, cost of facilities for conferences, publications</p> <p>Cost of Travel; DSA, Air tickets</p> <p>TA: National experts; Procurement of informational materials</p> <p>Technical Assistance: International and Local Experts; cost of facilities for conferences, publications</p>	<p><i>What are the sources of information on action progress?</i></p> <p>UNDP project monitoring reports</p> <p>Inception report, mid-term and final project reports; seminar, training and workshop reports; minutes of meetings; study tour report; training curricula</p> <p>Costs</p> <p><i>Breakdown in the Budget for the Action)</i></p>	<p>Required pre-conditions:</p> <p><i>Political commitment and enabling environment to make changes on legislative level</i></p> <p>What conditions outside the beneficiary direct control have to be met:</p> <p><i>An enabling policy environment</i></p> <p>Required pre-conditions:</p> <p>None</p> <p>What conditions outside the beneficiary direct control have to be met:</p> <p>None</p> <p>Required pre-conditions:</p> <p>None</p> <p>What conditions outside the beneficiary direct control have to be met:</p> <p>None</p> <p>Required pre-conditions:</p> <p><i>Commitment of the host countries to accept study visits for Azerbaijan</i></p> <p>What conditions outside the beneficiary direct control have to be met:</p> <p><i>Secure the commitment of targeted institutions in study visit countries</i></p> <p>Required pre-conditions:</p> <p>None</p> <p>What conditions outside the beneficiary direct control have to be met:</p> <p>None</p>

- 2.5. Explain how the Action has mainstreamed cross-cutting issues such as promotion of human rights, gender equality, democracy, good governance, children's rights and indigenous peoples, environmental sustainability and combating HIV/AIDS (if there is a strong prevalence in the target country/region).**

During the implementation period, the project helped in establishment and improvement of coordination and cooperation of various stakeholders included in specific sectors. As per request of project beneficiary, the project prepared the training curricula with supporting materials on environmental issues. The project beneficiary started pilot trainings for the female civil servants on various thematic, such as leadership skills, project management, presentation skill, HR management and etc. In addition, study tour to INAP resulted in developing set of recommendations, among which pilot trainings for disabled people is envisaged by APA as well.

- 2.6. How and by whom have the activities been monitored/evaluated? Please summarise the results of the feedback received from the beneficiaries and others.**

At the first stage of the project, the monitoring and evaluation of project activities was conducted through regular meetings of Joint Working Group. At the second stage of the project, JWG was substituted by the steering committee. All the ToRs for engagement of local and international experts were prepared in close collaboration with and selected candidate for experts were approved by CSC/APA, and project outputs were endorsed by them as well. The training participants evaluated the quality of trainings and provided some recommendations in evaluation forms.

At the end of the project, an expert was contracted to assess progress towards the achievement of the project objectives and outcomes as specified in the Project Document, and assess the relevance and sustainability of outputs as contributions to mid-term and longer-term outcomes. The expert hold series of meetings with EU and UNDP related representatives, project staff (former Project Manager and Project Officer), APA management and staff engaged in the activity of the Training Centre, trainers and training participants to get feedbacks about the project and summarized them in final report. The expert concluded that the evaluated project has been implemented under challenging circumstances, most notably, the unexpected abolishment of its initial partner institution, the Civil Service Commission. UNDP has succeeded in a commendable effort to safeguard the deliverables from the first phase of implementation, and to anchor it with a new partner institution in a short period of time. Equally, UNDP has managed to deliver a considerable amount of outputs. Strong aspects of the project design and approach include the Training-of-Trainers approach; as well as the considerable ownership of the new host institution, the Academy for Public Administration under the President of Azerbaijan.

- 2.7. What has your organisation or any actor involved in the Action learned from the Action and how has this learning been utilised and disseminated?**

During the entire period of the implementation, the project confronted with some obstacles that the implementing organisation has never been experienced before, i.e abolishment of the project beneficiary, Civil Service Commission. This fact stipulated for urgent reaction to keep the project outputs sustained and hand over the activities to the new beneficiary (Academy of Public Administration).

Lessons learned in this risk recognised and UNDP overcome these obstacles with better coordination and stronger cooperation with government administration. Beneficiary's abolishment and turnover the CSC staff who have been trained at the first stage of the project, have been identified a major challenge in ensuring sustainability in overall objective of the action.

2.8. Please list all materials (and number of copies) produced during the Action on whatever format (please enclose a copy of each item, except if you have already done so in the past).

The project produced number of power point presentation and other useful materials and documents which were used at the trainings. These materials were printed for the training participants. These materials are presented as annexes to this report. In addition, 30 training modules in 100 piece per each.

During the project implementation, the below materials have been produced:

- Brochure of international conference (250 pcs);
- 20 Training of trainers modules (3000 pcs)
- Folders, notepads (more than 3000 pcs), pens and flash cards with EU, UNDP and CSC/APA logos (more than 200 pcs);
- Rollups (10 pcs), door plates (4 pcs);
- Totally 11300 training materials for all training participants, including power point presentations (more than 3000 pcs), reading materials (more than 5000 pcs), evaluation forms (more than 3000 pcs), agendas (more than 300 pcs) etc.

2.9. Please list all contracts (works, supplies, services) above € 60000 awarded for the implementation of the Action since the last interim report if any or during the reporting period, giving for each contract the amount, the name of the contractor and a brief description on how the contractor was selected.

Contract	Amount awarded	Name of contractor	Selection process
Development of "Training Management System"	97,500 USD	IT Solutions	The RFP was announced through e-tendering on October 2, 2015 and one month period was given to the suppliers for preparation and submission of offers. RFP was placed at the UN/UNDP Azerbaijan, UNDP procurement Notice websites. The deadline for submission of proposals was November 20, 2015 18:00. But based on bidders' request the tender deadline was extended by November 25, 2015, 18:00. By the deadline only one proposal was received, the project had to finally extend the deadline for one more week, i.e. till December 03, 2015. By the deadline, four companies submitted the proposals. Due to lack of submitted documents, evaluation committee proceeded with evaluation of three other companies. One of the company failed to pass the technical evaluation. As a result of financial evaluation, IT Solution Company was found to provide the lowest price. Therefore, this company was selected for award of contract.

3. Beneficiaries/affiliated entities and other Cooperation

3.1. How do you assess the relationship between the beneficiaries/affiliated entities of this grant contract (i.e. those having signed the mandate for the Coordinator or an

affiliated entity statement)? Please provide specific information for each beneficiary/affiliated entity.

The project office and Training Centre is placed within the premises of the project beneficiary. Such position enables efficient daily communication with the Academy of Public Administration. UNDP's close and successful collaboration with the Academy was important precondition for successful implementation of the project.

3.2. Is the above agreement between the signatories to the grant contract to continue? If so, how? If not, why?

Being a solo applicant, UNDP does not envisage continuation of partnership on this agreement at the moment.

3.3. How would you assess the relationship between your organisation and State authorities in the Action countries? How has this relationship affected the Action?

UNDP has previous successful partnership with the Academy of Public Administration resulted in establishment of Human Development Resource Centre at the Academy of Public Administration under the President of Azerbaijan Republic, as the first knowledge-sharing hub of human development in the country. It was outcome of the project on Strengthening the Capacity of Educational Institutions for teaching and applying the human development concept.

Successful collaboration was important characteristic for continuation of the action after abolishment of CSC. The project improved mutual understanding and respect of partners.

3.4. Where applicable, describe your relationship with any other organisations involved in implementing the Action:

UNDP was sole implementer of the action and did not involve any third party in implementing the Action.

3.5. Where applicable, outline any links and synergies you have developed with other actions.

During the project implementation, UNDP closely cooperated with GIZ project on "Support to Civil Service Training Capacities with Focus on EU Affairs" which was also launched in the framework of the Comprehensive Institution-Building Programme to support Azerbaijan in the EU-Azerbaijan negotiations on Association Agreement, and aimed to strengthen capacities of the Civil Service Commission with regard to management and coordination of civil servants training and professional development. Both projects contributed to the achievement of the same overall objective and addressing all three specific objectives of the IRP3, made the overall intervention quite complete and comprehensive. After end of GIZ project, some of the outputs have been transferred to and completed by UNDP.

3.6. If your organisation has received previous EU grants in view of strengthening the same target group, in how far has this Action been able to build upon/complement the previous one(s)? (List all previous relevant EU grants).

N/A

3.7. How do you evaluate cooperation with the services of the Contracting Authority?

The relation was based on good communication flows with the contact persons in EUD.

4. Visibility

How is the visibility of the EU contribution being ensured in the Action?

The European Commission may wish to publicise the results of Actions. Do you have any objection to this report being published on the EuropeAid website? If so, please state your objections here.

Visibility of the EU contribution to the Action was implemented in line with the Communication and Visibility Plan. The Plan highlighted overall communication objectives, identified target groups, communication tools, indicators and resources. The Plan facilitated correct and timely recording of all EU visibility and communication activities.

When setting up the Training Centre, displayed panels with EU flag/logo “This is funded by EU” were applied to all the equipment and furniture. Door plates with EU, UNDP and APA logos were installed at the doors of all room of the Centre.

During the project life, the project conducted the following events:

- first for the kick-off event
- second for the international conference on “Capacity Development during the Public Administration Reforms”
- public hearings on Civil Service Code
- contract signing event with APA
- launch of Training Centre
- closing conference


Following the events, press releases were issued on UNDP website, as well as by major media agencies. The press releases are cleared with EU well before the issuance and incorporate EU flag and indicate amount of EU funding. All materials produced by the project include EU logo.

5. Location of records, accounting and supporting documents

Please indicate in a table the location of records, accounting and supporting documents for each Beneficiary and affiliated entity entitled to incur costs.

3, UN 50th anniversary street, Baku, Azerbaijan
UN Office in Azerbaijan

Name of the contact person for the Action: Alessandro Fracassetti, UNDP DRR

Signature:  Location: *Baku, Azerbaijan*

Date report due: Date report sent: *28.11.2017*